The Holy Orders Task Force Final Report
Prepared for the College of Bishops of the Anglican Church in North America
Table of Contents

Acknowledgements … 5

Foreword … 6

Section I: The Task Force and its Process

1. Introduction - The Rt. Rev. David Hicks … 9

Section II: A Unified Approach to Scripture

2. General Hermeneutical Principles - Task Force … 13
3. Summary of Hermeneutical Principles: Drawn from the
   Foundational Documents of the ACNA - Task Force … 14

Section III: Principles of Anglican Ecclesiology

4. Anglican Ecclesiology - Task Force … 18
5. Divergent Strands within the Anglican Tradition - Task Force … 27

6. The Ecclesiology of the Anglican Evangelical Tradition
   - The Rev. Dr. Leslie Fairfield … 32
   Anglican Evangelical Ecclesiology: A Synopsis … 32
   The Ecclesiology of the Evangelical Revival … 60
   Anglican Evangelicals in the Modern World … 77
   Endnotes … 102

7. The Ecclesiology of the Anglican High Church Tradition
   - The Rev. Tobias Karlowicz … 111
   The Ecclesiology of the Anglican High Church Tradition … 111
   The Commission of Christ: the Doctrine of Apostolic Succession … 123
   The Ministry of Christ: the Authority, Grace, and Character of
     Ordination … 144
   The Priesthood of Christ: the Eucharistic Sacrifice and ‘Sacerdotal’
     Priesthood … 152
8. Anglican Charismatics in the Modern West
   - *The Rev. Dr. Leslie Fairfield* … 194
     The Holy Spirit in the Church … 194
     The Wesleyan Revival … 201
     The Anglican Charismatic Tradition since 1960 … 209
     The Church in the Anglican Charismatic Tradition … 222
     Endnotes … 224

9. Perspectives in Anglican Ecclesiology- A Timeline … 227
   - *Mrs. Katherine Atwood*

10. A Case for Anglican Unity - *Task Force* … 245

Appendix I *The Order of Deaconesses in the American Episcopal Church* … 247
    - *Mrs. Katherine Atwood*

Appendix II *Chart on Women’s Ordination in the Anglican Provinces* … 256

Section IV: The Arguments For and Against … 257


12. Anglican Evangelicals and Women's Ordination … 260
    - *The Rev. Dr. Leslie Fairfield*
      The Matter of Names … 261
      The Influence of Modern Western Society … 262
      Presuppositions and Exegetical Practice … 264
      The Exegesis of Specific Texts … 269
      Endnotes … 275
13. Anglo-Catholics and the Ordination of Women ... 277
   - The Rev. Tobias Karlowicz

   The Traditionalist Argument ... 279
   Critical Arguments ... 283
   Review of the Arguments ... 285
   Women’s Ordination and the Character of the Ministry ... 294
   Endnotes ... 298

14. Bibliography for further Study - Task Force ... 300

   Sources from an Evangelical Perspective ... 300
   Sources from an Anglo-Catholic Perspective ... 306

Section V: Analysis and Conclusions ... 312

15. Final Summary - Task Force ... 313

   What We Were Asked to Do ... 313
   What We Have Learned ... 314
   What We Recommend ... 316
   Conclusion ... 318
Acknowledgements

Many thanks to Suzanne Gill, Director of Communications for the Diocese of Fort Worth for the gift of her time and expertise.
Foreword

To: Members of The Anglican Church in North America
From: Archbishop Foley Beach

Dear Brothers and Sisters in Christ,

In 2012 the College of Bishops appointed a Task Force on Holy Orders to provide the College with a scholarly and informed study on Holy Orders and, specifically, women in Holy Orders (the enabling resolution is reprinted in what follows). The Task Force, led by Bishop David Hicks, consisted of people representing differing perspectives and practices. They have met for the past 5 years and during that time have periodically released progress reports. This past January Bishop Hicks presented a report on the last phase of the process to the College, and we are now releasing the whole report to the Province.

Please note the following:

• The Task Force was not commissioned to resolve the issue, but was asked to develop resources to help the bishops in future conversation on this topic.
• Therefore the report does not answer the questions of what the College is to do, but it is a study presented to the College to help the College in our discussions.
• The report does not change our current practice regarding women’s orders as stated in our Constitution. Our current practice allows each diocese to determine whether it will ordain women as deacons or priests.
• The report will now be sent to the GAFCON Primates for their input and guidance for our discussions.
• The College of Bishops will now be studying the whole report, and we will meet in special session later in the year to discuss how we move forward together.

As your Archbishop, I ask the following from you:

1) Don’t comment on the report until you have read it all.
2) Don’t comment on the report until you can fairly articulate the opposite point of view.
3) Remember that no decisions have been made at this time to pursue changing our Constitution.
4) Remember that we are all followers of Jesus Christ on mission together, holding those with the opposite point of view in Christian love and charity.
5) Lastly, sincerely pray for your bishops as we seek to serve Jesus Christ in this matter.
Now to him who is able to do far more abundantly than all that we ask or think, according to the power at work within us, to him be glory in the church and in Christ Jesus throughout all generations, forever and ever.

Amen. Ephesians 3:20-21

Thank you to

The Rt. Rev. David Hicks, Chair The REC Diocese of the Northeast and Mid-Atlantic
The Rt. Rev. Kevin Allen, The Diocese of Cascadia
Mrs. Katherine Atwood, The Diocese of Ft. Worth
The Rev. Dr. Leslie Fairfield, The Diocese in New England & Trinity School for Ministry (Ret.)
The Rev. Canon Mary Hays, The Diocese of Pittsburgh
The Rev. Tobias Karlowicz, The Diocese of Quincy
The Rt. Rev. Eric Menees, The Diocese of San Joaquin

for your service to the Province by serving on the Task Force. Your hard work is much appreciated!

The Most Rev. Dr. Foley Beach
Archbishop and Primate of the Anglican Church in North America
Section I: The Task Force and its Process
Introduction

This presentation of the work of the Theological Task Force on Holy Orders is a compendium of reports given to the College of Bishops and Provincial Councils of the Anglican Church in North America between January 2013 and January 2017. Each report was presented upon the completion of each of the five successive phases of a Method of Procedure, which was approved by the College of Bishops.

The Task Force was commissioned by Archbishop Robert Duncan, and renewed by Archbishop Foley Beach, to lead the College of Bishops in a discussion about the nature and purpose of holy orders, with a particular view toward the issue of the ordination of women. This was the fulfillment of a commitment made by the bishops at the time of the organization of the ACNA in 2009. It seemed wise to save the discussion about women’s ordination for a later point, after the province had been constituted and settled into a stable pattern and structure of life together.

While our province has a common understanding of the Christian faith, as expressed in the Anglican tradition, the Task Force recognizes that there are some significant differences in among us in the way that we read Scripture (hermeneutics) and our understanding of the nature of the church and ordained ministry (ecclesiology). The reports from phases two and three address these topics respectively. Any discussion about the interpretation of the relevant biblical texts must take into consideration the underlying theological commitments related to hermeneutics and ecclesiology. The Task Force is hopeful that this part of its work will be especially helpful to the bishops, leading toward fruitful discussion beyond the usual impasse that comes from debates about the ordination of women.

The method of procedure also takes into account the bond of fellowship that our province enjoys with other provinces in the Anglican Communion. We have been in communication with leaders in the Global Anglican Future Conference (GAFCON) partnership of Anglican churches, and we anticipate more formal discussion of this report in the months ahead.

Finally, I wish to express my sincere thanks to the membership of the Task Force. Each person made important contributions to the production of our reports, and I am indebted to them for their patience, theological acumen, and deepened friendship through these years of working together.

The Rt. Rev. David L. Hicks, PhD
Chairman
**Task Force Members**

**The Rt. Rev. David Hicks**, Chair *The REC Diocese of the Northeast and Mid-Atlantic*

The Rt. Rev. Dr. David L. Hicks is Bishop Ordinary of the Diocese of the Northeast and Mid-Atlantic and President of Reformed Episcopal Seminary, Blue Bell, Pennsylvania. He received a Master of Sacred Theology from the Lutheran Theological Seminary, Philadelphia, and MAR and PhD degrees from Westminster Theological Seminary, Philadelphia. He and his wife, Lisa, reside in Oreland, Pennsylvania.

**The Rt. Rev. Kevin Allen**, *The Diocese of Cascadia*

The Rt. Rev. Kevin Bond Allen was unanimously elected the first bishop of the ACNA Diocese of Cascadia and was consecrated September 30th 2011. Bishop Kevin studied at Pacific Lutheran University and the University of Washington (BA), Roman Catholic Seattle University (graduate studies), Ridley Hall Cambridge UK and General Theological Seminary NY (MDiv). He began his ministry with youth in the 70’s; continued as a lay missioner overseas in London and Bangladesh. He continued that ministry as the first vicar of Cambodian Episcopal Church with refugees in Tacoma WA, and eventually assisted in founding the Diocese of Cascadia. He currently serves on the national board of SOMA USA and is chair of the Orthodox-Anglican Dialogue provincial task force. He is married to Stefanie and lives in Silverdale, Washington.

**Mrs. Katherine Atwood**, *The Diocese of Ft. Worth*

Katherine Buckler Atwood received her undergraduate degree in Biology from Villanova University in 1980. She went on to study at Westminster Theological Seminary, and Trinity School for Ministry (M.Div. ’84). She is active in missions, and trained with the ECMC in Pasadena. She also worked with theological students, encouraging them to bring missions to their future parishes. She has been actively involved in the theological debate on the issue of ordination since the 70’s and has attended four general Conventions to be an official part of the debate both in formal settings and informally, working with ECM, Forward in Faith, and the Diocese of Fort Worth. She is an examining chaplain for the Diocese in Church History and assists in the diaconal training program. She and her husband Jay have been married for 32 years and currently serve in the parish of St. Francis of Assisi, in Willow Park.
The Rev. Dr. Leslie Fairfield, *The Diocese in New England & Trinity School for Ministry (Ret.)*

The Rev. Dr. Leslie Fairfield was educated at Princeton (A.B. 1962) and Harvard (Ph.D. 1969). He is Professor Emeritus of Church History at Trinity School for Ministry in Ambridge, PA where he taught from 1976 to 2006. He was ordained as a deacon in the Diocese of Pittsburgh by Bishop Appleyard in June of 1982 and was ordained as priest in December of the same year. He married his wife Lynn in 1966 and they presently live in Amherst, Massachusetts.

The Rev. Canon Mary Hays, *The Diocese of Pittsburgh*

Mary Hays has been working with Christian leaders of all ages, lay and ordained, for more than 40 years. Mary graduated from Smith College (A.B. in religion), Berkeley Divinity School at Yale (M. Div.), and Fuller Theological Seminary (D. Min.), and was ordained in the Episcopal Diocese of Connecticut. (Deacon, 1983; Priest, 1984). She served as a Canon to Archbishop Duncan in the Anglican Diocese of Pittsburgh for 17 years. Prior to that she taught in the areas of leadership and spirituality at Trinity Episcopal School for Ministry for nine years and served parishes in Connecticut and Virginia. She has been married to the Rev. Whis Hays for 42 years.

The Rev. Tobias Karlowicz, *The Diocese of Quincy*

Tobias A. Karlowicz studied music and philosophy at Oberlin College prior to attending seminary at Nashotah House. In 2013, he received his PhD from the University of St Andrew for a thesis on the theology of E.B. Pusey. After seminary, he ministered in two congregations in rural Illinois; he now assists at St. Michael and All Angels Church in Peoria, Illinois. He is Canon Theologian of the Diocese of Quincy, adjunct professor of Church History at Nashotah House, and a member of the Society of the Holy Cross (SSC).

The Rt. Rev. Eric Menees, *The Diocese of San Joaquin*

Bishop Menees is the fifth bishop of the Diocese of San Joaquin having been consecrated Bishop Ordinary on October 22, 2011. Bishop Menees took his D.Min at Seabury Western and his M.Div at General Seminary. Prior to coming to San Joaquin Bishop Menees served as founding pastor at the Church of the Resurrection, San Marcos, CA., and Rector at Grace Church. In addition, Bishop Menees ministered in several Spanish Language parishes founding the Spanish Language congregations at St. Paul’s, San Diego and Messiah, Santa Ana. Bishop Menees is married to Florence with two children, Milagro and Sebastian.